

<b>Application Number</b>	18/1309/S73	<b>Agenda Item</b>	
<b>Date Received</b>	16th August 2018	<b>Officer</b>	Alice Young
<b>Target Date</b>	11th October 2018		
<b>Ward</b>	Trumpington		
<b>Site</b>	2 Barrow Road Cambridge CB2 8AS		
<b>Proposal</b>	Section 73 application to vary condition 1 (Approved Drawings) of permission 15/0804/FUL (New dwelling to rear of site with access from Trumpington Road) to omit the basement level and ground floor rooflights, enlarge the first floor and install a green roof.		
<b>Applicant</b>	Mr Hartley c/o PiP Architecture		

<b>SUMMARY</b>	<p>The development accords with the Development Plan for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The proposed first floor extension would not give rise to any adverse impacts to neighbouring amenity and would be in keeping with character and appearance of the surrounding area.</li> <li>▪ The proposal would preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the Barrow Road Conservation Area.</li> </ul>
<b>RECOMMENDATION</b>	<b>APPROVAL</b>

**1.0 SITE DESCRIPTION/AREA CONTEXT**

1.1 The application site relates to a detached residential property with a large plot situated on the southern corner of Barrow Road and Trumpington Road. The large rear garden is approximately 1,950m<sup>2</sup>; located along the boundary parallel to Trumpington

Road are mature trees which are all protected by a group tree preservation order.

- 1.2 The existing property on the site has an Arts and Crafts style with a regular footprint, symmetrical fenestration and projecting front garage.
- 1.3 The site now falls within the Barrow Road Conservation Area and is located on the southern boundary of this part of the Conservation Area. The previous application for which this is connected to was approved before the designation date of the Barrow Road Conservation Area (06.02.16).

## **2.0 THE PROPOSAL**

- 2.1 The current application is to vary the consent 15/0804/FUL for a new dwelling to the rear of the site with access from Trumpington Road.
- 2.2 Application reference 15/0804/FUL was previously approved to sub-divide the garden of No. 2 Barrow Road and erect a new two storey dwelling on the land south of No. 2 Barrow Road, fronting Trumpington Road. This previously approved dwelling was designed in a modern style with two sloping mono-pitched roofs and a single storey flat roof element to the southern elevation. A number of revisions to the original design, including an additional floor above the garage element, were approved at committee in November 2017 (17/1444/S73).
- 2.3 The variation sought is to condition 1 (Approved Drawings) to:
  - omit the basement level;
  - remove the ground floor rooflights on the single storey located to the south west of the site;
  - enlarge the first floor to the north elevation parallel to the boundary with No. 2's rear garden;
  - install a green roof on the single storey element on the south western corner parallel to the highway.

## **3.0 SITE HISTORY**

### **Land to the rear of No.2 Barrow Road (application site)**

<b>Reference</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Outcome</b>
14/1616/FUL	New dwelling	Withdrawn

15/0804/FUL	New dwelling to rear of site with access from Trumpington Road	Granted
17/1444/S73	Section 73 application to vary condition 1 of planning permission 15/0804/FUL dated 04/11/2015 for new dwelling to rear of site with access from Trumpington Road to allow the removal of the basement pool, extension to form bedroom at first floor level and alterations to fenestration.	Granted

#### 4.0 PUBLICITY

4.1	Advertisement:	Yes
	Adjoining Owners:	Yes
	Site Notice Displayed:	Yes

#### 5.0 POLICY

5.1 See Appendix 1 for full details of Central Government Guidance, Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policies, Supplementary Planning Documents and Material Considerations.

5.2 Relevant Development Plan policies

PLAN		POLICY NUMBER
Cambridge Plan 2018	Local	<b>27</b> <b>35</b> <b>50 51 52</b> <b>55 56 57 59 61 71</b> <b>81 82</b>

### 5.3 Relevant Central Government Guidance, Supplementary Planning Documents and Material Considerations

<p>Central Government Guidance</p>	<p>National Planning Policy Framework July 2018</p> <p>National Planning Policy Framework – Planning Practice Guidance March 2014</p> <p>Circular 11/95 (Annex A)</p> <p>Technical housing standards – nationally described space standard – published by Department of Communities and Local Government March 2015 (material consideration)</p>
<p>Supplementary Planning Guidance</p>	<p>Sustainable Design and Construction (May 2007)</p> <p>Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Waste Partnership (RECAP): Waste Management Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document (February 2012)</p> <p>Planning Obligation Strategy (March 2010)</p>
<p>Material Considerations</p>	<p><u>City Wide Guidance</u></p> <p>Cycle Parking Guide for New Residential Developments (2010)</p>
	<p><u>Area Guidelines</u></p> <p>Barrow Road Conservation Area Appraisal (2016)</p> <p>Trumpington Road Suburbs and Approaches Study (March 2012)</p>

## 6.0 CONSULTATIONS

### **Cambridgeshire County Council (Highways Development Management)**

- 6.1 The Highway Authority has no comment to make upon this application.

### **Environmental Health**

- 6.2 The development proposed is acceptable subject to the imposition of the conditions outlined below:
- CC63 – construction hours
  - EH1 – collections/deliveries during construction
  - PILING – piling condition

### **Urban Design and Conservation Team**

#### *First comments*

- 6.3 The development proposed is unacceptable and should be refused for the reason(s) set out below:
- This proposal does not enhance or preserve the character and appearance of the Barrow Road conservation area.
  - The proposed extension does not enhance the design of the approved house.

#### *Amended plans*

- 6.4 The development proposed is acceptable for the reasons outlined below:
- The previous design for the proposed extension presented a square block to the road which looked at odds with the mono pitched roof next to it. Whilst the extension is set back it did not look integrated into the design.
  - This amendment has given the new extension a further mono pitch roof which creates a gull wing form helping the new extension sit more comfortably with the remainder of the upper floors of the original design.

### **Landscape Architects**

- 6.5 It is considered that there are no material landscape issues with this proposal.

## **Sustainable Drainage Engineer**

- 6.6 No objections subject to a surface water drainage condition.
- 6.7 The above responses are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the consultation responses can be inspected on the application file.

### **7.0 REPRESENTATIONS**

- 7.1 The owners/occupiers of the following addresses have made representations:
- 4 Barrow Road
  - 6 Barrow Road
  - 11 Barrow Road
  - 21 Barrow Road
  - 24 Barrow Road
  - 27 Barrow Road
  - 30 Trumpington Road
- 7.2 The representations can be summarised as follows:
- Loss of light and overshadowing to No. 4 and No. 2 Barrow Road (in winter particularly)
  - The design and materials are not in character with the surrounding area and would adversely impact the character of the area
  - A bunglalow like the nearby 'infills' would have been more appropriate for this site.
  - Does not preserve or enhance the conservation area
  - The rectangular box addition fits uneasily with the design of the house, providing an ugly view from Trumpington Road.
  - Concern for the chestnut tree, the roots of which may well be damaged
  - The noise disturbance
  - Concerns over the removal of mature trees on the boundary with No. 30 Trumpington Road
  - Request for a light study
  - Impact on privacy for No. 30 Trumpington Road and no. 4 Barrow Road
- 7.3 The above representations are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the representations can be inspected on the application file.

## **8.0 ASSESSMENT**

8.1 From the consultation responses and representations received and from my inspection of the site and the surroundings, I consider that the main issues are:

1. Principle of development
2. Context of site, design and external spaces (and impact on heritage assets)
3. Residential amenity
4. Refuse arrangements
5. Car and cycle parking
6. Third party representations

### **Principle of Development**

8.2 The principle of the erection of a new detached two storey dwelling has been established through the extant consent (15/0804/FUL), which was approved at committee in September 2015. Whilst policy has changed with the adoption of the new Cambridge Local Plan (2018), it is considered that the proposal still adheres to the sub-division of existing dwelling plots policy (policy 52 of the Cambridge Local Plan 2018). Explanation of the criteria is located under the relevant headings.

8.3 The assessment for this current application focuses on the material changes that are being sought which consist of the removal of the basement, addition of the green roof and the addition of a first floor element located above the previously approved garage.

8.4 In my opinion, the principle of the development is acceptable and in accordance with policy 52.

### **Context of site, design and external spaces (and impact on the Conservation Area)**

#### Response to context

8.5 This current application assesses the amendments to the previously approved scheme (15/0804/FUL). The removal of the basement and rooflights are considered acceptable changes which would not adversely impact the design, scale or massing of the proposal. The addition of the first floor extension is to

compensate for the loss of the basement level. A previous application which was approved at committee (17/1444/S73) included a first floor extension over the garage on the north elevation facing No. 2 Barrow Road similar to the one proposed. The proposed first floor extension would be situated on the north elevation facing No. 2 Barrow Road and would project over the previously approved garage to the side elevation by 3.2 metres and stretch 9.4 metres to the rear. This element would be stepped in by 0.6 metres from the rear elevation and 1.85 metres from the front elevation of the previously approved plans. This first floor extension would provide a fourth bedroom, ensuite and dressing room. The proposed roof would slope down towards the previously approved first floor which would have a height of 5.945 metres to the ridge. The scheme has been amended by changing the roof from a flat roof to a mono-pitch roof which creates a gull wing form with the upper floor of the original design. This was to decrease the massing of the proposed first floor addition, create a better relationship with the rest of the dwelling and to enhance the conservation area.

- 8.6 The Barrow Road Conservation Area Appraisal states that Barrow Road is characterized by the Arts and Crafts movement as well as the later additions of 'Cautious Modernism' and 'Modernism further down Barrow Road. All of these properties, with mixed character, have been designed to have a relationship between the buildings and leafy setting with wide green verges to the front and generous rear gardens. This characteristic was adopted in the previous applications. As the site is within the boundary of the Barrow Road Conservation Area but runs parallel to the more modern two storey houses on Trumpington Road, the design successfully acts as another later addition to the extension of Barrow Road. The design and materials of the proposed first floor element would match the previously approved scheme, which was considered to successfully contrast with the prevailing 'Arts and Crafts' style of the surrounding area and not detract from this character. This still stands, as the proposed first floor extension is considered to enhance the character of the Barrow Road Conservation Area.
- 8.7 In my opinion the proposal is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2018) policies 55, 56, 57, 59 and 61.

## **Residential Amenity**

Impact on amenity of neighbouring occupiers

### Overlooking

- 8.8 The addition of a window on the first floor element would not unduly cause significant overlooking due to the substantial distance of in excess of 40 metres separating No. 4 Barrow Road and this element. Therefore, there would be no loss of privacy experienced by No. 4. This is the only window added to the application and the previous application considered there would not be any harmful overlooking to neighbours. Therefore, I do not consider there to be an issue of overlooking.

### Overshadowing

- 8.9 The northern orientation of No. 2 and 4 Barrow Road in relation to the application site and the location of the first floor element makes these the only nearby properties that could potentially be overshadowed. No. 30 Trumpington Road and No. 5 Porson Road are situated directly south of the site and the first floor extension is on the northern elevation, therefore, levels of light reaching these properties would not be affected by the first floor element.
- 8.10 The separation distance between No. 2 Barrow Road and the proposed first floor extension exceeds 30 metres. This is considered a sufficient distance not to impact on No. 2's sunlight levels. Whilst there may be additional overshadowing, this would be to the very rear of the garden of No. 2 Barrow Road and therefore would not significantly harm the amenity of No.2.
- 8.11 The significant distance between the application site and No. 4 Barrow Road would mitigate any significant overshadowing to No. 4. It is noted that there would be overshadowing in the end part of the garden in the evening hours but this level of overshadowing would be minimal and therefore not considered harmful to residential amenity.

### Visual enclosure/ dominance

- 8.12 Due to the siting of the extension, relatively low height at first floor of 5.945 metres and the separation distance between the properties, the first floor extension would not significantly impact No. 2 and No. 4 Barrow Road.

### Noise disturbance

- 8.13 The previous application considered the levels of noise and disturbance resulting from the proposal to be minimal due to the residential nature. I do not consider that this will change with the removal of the basement level and rooflights and addition of the first floor element.
- 8.14 In my opinion the proposal adequately respects the residential amenity of its neighbours and the constraints of the site and I consider that it is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2018) policies 35, 55 and 56.

### Amenity for future occupiers of the site

- 8.15 The amenity of future occupiers was considered acceptable with the previous application. The loss of the basement level would mean a loss of two bedrooms; however, the addition of the first floor element would result in a net loss of only one bedroom. Therefore, I do not consider that this loss will detrimentally impact the future occupiers' amenity. The removal of the rooflights on the single storey element would decrease light levels within the front sitting room. However, there are multiple windows serving this room facing both east and west; this would provide sufficient levels of light.

The gross internal floor space measurements for units in this application are shown in the table below:

Unit	Number of bedrooms	Number of bed spaces (persons)	Number of storeys	Policy Size requirement (m <sup>2</sup> )	Proposed size of unit	Difference in size
1	4	7	2	115	239.55	+124.55

8.16 There was no previous policy regarding residential space standards when the previous application was submitted, notwithstanding, the application meets these standards.

8.17 The development has been assessed for compliance with Policy 51 and, subject to a minor revision to the internal layout, complies with the requirements of Part M4 (2) of the Building Regulations. I have recommended a condition to secure this requirement.

#### Size of external amenity space

8.18 There has been no change to the external amenity space and therefore it is considered acceptable for amount of residents the garden would serve.

8.19 In my opinion the proposal provides a high-quality (*and accessible*) living environment and an appropriate standard of residential amenity for future occupiers, and I consider that in this respect it is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2018) policies 50 and 51.

#### **Refuse Arrangements**

8.20 The changes to the scheme do not impact on refuse arrangements, therefore, this is still considered acceptable.

8.21 In my opinion the proposal is compliant in this respect with Cambridge Local Plan (2018) policy 57.

#### **Car and cycle parking**

8.22 The changes to the scheme do not impact on refuse arrangements, therefore, this is still considered acceptable.

8.23 In my opinion the proposal is compliant in this respect with Cambridge Local Plan (2018) policy 82.

#### **Third Party Representations**

8.24 The majority of the third party representations have been addressed in the main body of this report.

8.25 With regard to the concerns about the trees surrounding the dwelling, in the previous application it was illustrated that the proposed dwelling would not fall within the root protection zones of the surrounding trees. The previous application had a tree protection condition that has been discharged and would apply to the current scheme.

8.26 The concerns regarding loss of light to No. 30 Trumpington Road have been addressed in paragraph 8.9. Therefore, a light study would not be necessary.

## **9.0 RECOMMENDATION**

**APPROVE** subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun on or before 4th November 2018.

Reason: In accordance with the requirements of section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans as listed on this decision notice.

Reason: In the interests of good planning, for the avoidance of doubt and to facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

3. The en-suite bathroom first-floor windows and the secondary first-floor master bedroom window on the south elevation, as shown on drawing no.PL-2-01 REV B, shall be obscure glazed to a minimum level of obscurity to conform to Pilkington Glass level 3 or equivalent prior to commencement of use (of the dwelling) and shall have restrictors to ensure that the window cannot be opened more than 45 degrees beyond the plane of the adjacent wall and shall be retained as such thereafter.

Reason: In the interests of residential amenity (Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policies 55 and 57).

4. Conditions 3 -4 and 6-17 of planning permission 15/0804/FUL (as set out below) shall continue to apply to this permission. Where such conditions pertaining to 15/0804/FUL have been discharged, the development of 18/1309/S73 shall be carried out in accordance with the terms of discharge and those conditions shall be deemed to be discharged for this permission also.

Reason: To define the terms of the application.

5. No construction work or demolition work shall be carried out or plant operated other than between the following hours: 0800 hours and 1800 hours on Monday to Friday, 0800 hours and 1300 hours on Saturday and at no time on Sundays, Bank or Public Holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of the adjoining properties. (Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policy 35)

6. In the event of the foundations for the proposed development requiring piling, prior to the development taking place the applicant shall provide the local authority with a report / method statement for approval detailing the type of piling and mitigation measures to be taken to protect local residents from noise and/or vibration. Potential noise and vibration levels at the nearest noise sensitive locations shall be predicted in accordance with the provisions of BS 5228-1&2:2009 Code of Practice for noise and vibration control on construction and open sites. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. Due to the proximity of this site to existing residential premises and other noise sensitive premises, impact pile driving is not recommended.

Reason: To protect the amenity of nearby properties (Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policy 35).

7. No building hereby permitted shall be occupied until surface water drainage works have been implemented in accordance with details that have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Before these details are submitted an assessment shall be carried out of the potential for disposing of surface water by means of a sustainable drainage system in accordance with the principles set out in The National Planning Policy Framework and associated Guidance, and the results of the assessment provided to the local planning authority. The submitted details shall:
- i. provide information about the design storm period and intensity, the method employed to delay and control the surface water discharged from the site and the measures taken to prevent pollution of the receiving groundwater and/or surface waters; and
  - ii. provide a management and maintenance plan for the lifetime of the development and any arrangements to secure the operation of the scheme throughout its lifetime.

Reason: To minimise flood risk (Cambridge Local Plan 2018, Policy 31).

8. No unbound material shall be used in the surface finish of the driveway within 6 metres of the highway boundary of the site.

Reason: To avoid displacement of loose material onto the highway in the interests of highway safety

9. Notwithstanding the provision of Class A of Schedule 2, Part 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015, (or any order revoking, amending or re-enacting that order) no gates shall be erected across the approved access unless details have first been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety.

10. Prior to the commencement of the first use the vehicular access where it crosses the public highway shall be laid out and constructed in accordance with the Cambridgeshire County Council construction specification.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety and to ensure satisfactory access into the site.

11. The access shall be constructed with adequate drainage measures to prevent surface water runoff onto the adjacent public highway, in accordance with a scheme submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, in consultation with the Highway Authority.

Reason: To prevent surface water discharging to the highway.

12. Two 2.0 x 2.0 metres visibility splays shall be provided as shown on the drawings. The splays are to be included within the curtilage of the new dwelling. One visibility splay is required on each side of the access, measured to either side of the access, with a set-back of two metres from the highway boundary along each side of the access. This area shall be kept clear of all planting, fencing, walls and the like exceeding 600mm high.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety.

13. The manoeuvring area shall be provided as shown on the drawings and retained free of obstruction.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety.

14. The access shall be provided as shown on the approved drawings and retained free of obstruction.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety.

15. No demolition or construction works shall commence on site until a traffic management plan has been agreed with the Planning Authority in consultation with the Highway Authority. The principle areas of concern that should be addressed are:
  - i. Movements and control of muck away lorries (all loading and unloading should be undertaken off the adopted public highway)
  - ii. Contractor parking, for both phases all such parking should be within the curtilage of the site and not on street.
  - iii. Movements and control of all deliveries (all loading and unloading should be undertaken off the adopted public highway)
  - iv. Control of dust, mud and debris, please note it is an offence under the Highways Act 1980 to deposit mud or debris onto the adopted public highway.

Reason: in the interests of highway safety

16. No development shall take place until an arboricultural method statement, tree constraints plan and tree protection plan, in accordance with BS:5837:2005, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. These shall include:
- a) Plans showing trees to be removed, identified by number.
  - b) Plans showing trees to be retained, identified by number, with canopies accurately plotted.
  - c) A tree constraints plan that identifies root protection areas of retained trees within, adjacent to, or which overhang the development site.
  - d) The precise location and design details for the erection of protective tree barriers and any other physical protection measures.
  - e) A method statement in relation to construction operations in accordance with paragraph 7.2 of the British Standard.

The arboricultural method statement shall be carried out as approved unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and safeguarding trees that are worthy of retention (Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policy 71).

17. The approved AMS and TPP will be implemented throughout the development and the agreed means of protection shall be retained on site until all equipment, and surplus materials have been removed from the site. Nothing shall be stored or placed in any area protected in accordance with this condition, and the ground levels within those areas shall not be altered nor shall any excavation be made without the prior written approval of the local planning authority.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and safeguarding trees that are worthy of retention (Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policy 71).

18. No development shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority a plan indicating the positions, design, materials and type of boundary treatment to be erected. The boundary treatment shall be completed before the building(s) is/are occupied and retained thereafter unless any variation is agreed in writing by the local planning authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure an appropriate boundary treatment is implemented. (Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policies 55, 57 and 59)

19. The dwelling, hereby permitted, shall be constructed to meet the requirements of Part M4(2) 'accessible and adaptable dwellings' of the Building Regulations 2010 (as amended 2016).

Reason: To secure the provision of accessible housing (Cambridge Local Plan 2018 policy 51)

**INFORMATIVE:** This development involves work to the public highway that will require the approval of the County Council as Highway Authority. It is an OFFENCE to carry out any works within the public highway, which includes a public right of way, without the permission of the Highway Authority. Please note that it is the applicant's responsibility to ensure that, in addition to planning permission, any necessary consents or approvals under the Highways Act 1980 and the New Roads and Street Works Act 1991 are also obtained from the County Council. No part of any structure may overhang or encroach under or upon the public highway unless licensed by the Highway Authority and no gate / door / ground floor window shall open outwards over the public highway.

**INFORMATIVE:** Public Utility apparatus may be affected by this proposal. Contact the appropriate utility service to reach agreement on any necessary alterations, the cost of which must be borne by the applicant.

**INFORMATIVE:** The pergola structure shown on the elevations is outside the red-line ownership of this application. Approval of this planning application does not include the erection of this pergola structure.